

Meeting Minutes

Mayors' Commission on Climate Change Meeting #9

Virtual Meeting | June 29, 2020

The following Commissioners were present during the meeting:

Anne Stausboll | Commission Chair
Meg Arnold | Project Lead & Consultant, Valley Vision
Alberto Ayala | Executive Director, Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality Management District
Amanda Blackwood | President and CEO, Sacramento Metro Chamber of Commerce
Stephanie Bray | President and CEO, United Way Capital Region
James Corless | CEO, Sacramento Area Council of Governments
Steve Hansen | Vice Mayor, City of Sacramento
Chris Ledesma | Mayor Pro Tem, City of West Sacramento
Henry Li | General Manager and CEO, Sacramento Regional Transit
Laurie Litman | President, 350 Sacramento
Nikky Mohanna | Principal, Mohanna Development
Robert Nelsen | President, California State University Sacramento
Arlen Orchard | CEO, Sacramento Municipal Utility District
Nailah Pope-Harden | Director, Nailah Outreach Consulting
Trish Rodriguez | Senior VP, Kaiser Permanente
Dave Tanner | CEO, Sacramento Association of Realtors
Mike Teel | Owner and Chairman, Raley's
April Wick | Executive Director, Resources for Independent Living
Mackenzie Wieser | Planning Commissioner, City of Elk Grove

Also present during the meeting:

Mayor Darrell Steinberg | City of Sacramento
Mayor Christopher Cabaldon | City of West Sacramento
Kate Meis | Executive Director, Local Government Commission
Julia Kim | Director of Climate Change and Energy Programs, Local Government Commission
David Tilley | Principal Planner, City of West Sacramento
Matt Hertel | Principal Planner, City of Sacramento
Julia Burrows | Senior Policy Advisor to Mayor Darrell Steinberg, City of Sacramento

Call to Order

Chair Stausboll called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM.

Opening Remarks

Chair Stausboll welcomed commissioners and the public to the meeting. She shared appreciation for public members who engaged throughout the Commission's work and particularly to those who provided public comment and letters of support.

Remarks from the Mayors

West Sacramento Mayor Christopher Cabaldon expressed gratitude to public members and stakeholders who engaged in the Commission's work. He provided brief remarks highlighting the urgency of addressing climate change, as well as equity, diversity, justice, and inclusion and the opportunities at hand to make progress towards the

Sacramento Mayor Darrell Steinberg expressed gratitude to the Chair for her leadership, commissioners, staff, and the public. He noted the significance of the Commission's work – not just the outcome, but the process that helped to keep climate change a priority. He expressed support for the Environmental Justice Collaborative Governance Committee, which will be led by communities. He thanked commissioners for not shying away from controversy, which forces different perspectives, creativity, and action.

Adoption of the Final Report

Meis presented the Commission's Final Report and expressed gratitude for all TAC members, particularly those who engaged in the Equity TAC. She provided an overview of the Foundational Principles, Equity Recommendations, and how sectors were defined to create the TACs.

Meis provided a summary of report changes and noted that the "Supplemental Report" was renamed to "Technical Report" to recognize the level of work and expertise that went into the development of the report.

Meis provided an overview of public comments received, which included 138 comments and 33 letters of support. Key themes reflected in comments include the urgency of addressing climate change, the importance of equity, and the need to look at economic and COVID recovery through a climate lens. Public comments that expressed opposition, which included 109 comments and 5 letters, were all focused on electrification with 104 of the 109 comments received focused on a disclosure statement regarding propane. Remaining comments focused on the importance of consumer choice, questions related to cost-effectiveness, and energy resilience.

Chair Stausboll invited commissioners to express concerns or to share amendments prior to voting.

Mohanna shared concerns regarding the Built Environment Recommendation #2 (Electrification of New Construction). She expressed that technological improvements and incentives are needed to ensure all-electric buildings can be constructed in a cost-effective manner to provide affordable housing, increase density, and reduce vehicle emissions. Mohanna proposed an amendment to Built Environment Recommendation #2:

Mandate all-electric construction to eliminate fossil-fuel use in new low-rise* buildings by 2023 and all buildings by 2026**

**low rise defined as under 4 stories*

***provided that the costs to go all-electric are cost-effective including the incremental costs of electrical infrastructure upgrades and the technology has shown to be feasible*

Motion to replace Built Environment Recommendation #2 with proposed amendment: Moved by Mohanna and seconded by Tanner.

Orchard expressed support for the amendment, recognizing challenges related to electric hot water heating, infill development, and cost-effectiveness.

Ayala expressed support for the amendment, recognizing Mohanna and Orchard's expertise. He also noted the importance of achieving full electrification as soon as possible to protect public health.

Litman expressed support for the amendment, but also shared her disappointment. She urged the cities to work with utilities to remove barriers and upgrade infrastructure to enable the cities to move as quickly as possible when 2026 arrives. She also urged ordinances to be passed earlier than 2026 if barriers are removed sooner.

Hansen expressed support for the amendment, noting the importance of communicating and working together to reach a shared understanding. He agreed that infrastructure upgrades and technological advancements are needed to enable infill development. He encouraged other entities, including SMUD and SMAQMD, to join the cities and utilities in removing barriers to electrification.

Wick expressed concern regarding the timeline continuously shifting back and asked what would stop the timeline from shifting back again if there are barriers that still remain in 2026. Mohanna responded and expressed the importance of identifying models and pursuing pilots leading up to 2026 to demonstrate feasibility. She expressed commitment to being actively involved.

Orchard noted that SMUD committed \$7 billion on decarbonization with \$2 billion towards building and transportation electrification. He highlighted ongoing efforts in working with developers to accelerate electrification, noting significant progress on all-electric homes but challenges remaining for multi-family buildings.

Arnold noted how the amendment could send a strong market signal to manufacturers and providers to spur research and development and help to accelerate technological advancements.

Blackwood thanked the Commission for their willingness to consider the amendment. She expressed that Metro Chamber previously opposed the recommendation, but would be able to support if the amendment passes.

The motion to replace Built Environment Recommendation #2 with the proposed amendment passes with 17 AYES, 1 NAY (Wick), and 1 ABSTAIN (Rodriguez).

Ledesma noted challenges related to the City of West Sacramento's electric utility and deficient infrastructure. Ledesma proposed an addition to the Foundational Principle of Advocacy:

Resolve the challenges faced by West Sacramento in electricity service, reliability, cost competitiveness, infrastructure, rates, and local climate investments due to asymmetry in electric utility providers, by supporting the transition of West Sacramento to a more climate-supportive utility service that would enable the city to implement the full suite of proposed strategies.

Motion to include the proposed addition to the Advocacy Foundational Principle: Moved by Ledesma and seconded by Corless.

Corless noted the importance of ensuring West Sacramento has what it needs to succeed.

Orchard noted that he will vote AYE recognizing the importance of partnerships to achieve the goals of the report, but noted that his vote should not be construed as an endorsement that SMUD would be the provider. Ledesma expressed understanding and appreciation for his support.

Hansen noted the importance of broader advocacy to support other cities in the region that face similar challenges as West Sacramento.

The motion to make an addition to the Advocacy Foundational Principle passes unanimously.

Motion to adopt the Commission's Final Report: Moved by Hansen and seconded by Bray.

The motion to adopt and submit the final report passes unanimously.

City Next Steps Towards Implementation

David Tilley with City of West Sacramento presented an overview of the City's timeline for their Climate & Resiliency Action Plan, which has been informed by the Commission's work. The City is developing an inventory and reduction measures and planning to conduct outreach virtually as in-person outreach has been suspended due to COVID-19. Tilley shared that after the close of the Commission, the City will present a final report to full Council, complete the Housing Element and SB-379 and SB-1000 work, complete the vulnerability assessment, explore opportunities to accelerate implementation of mobility strategies, and advance SB-743 efforts.

Ayala expressed appreciation for the City's commitment and leadership in the mobility sector.

Ledesma highlighted the success of the VIA program.

Stausboll expressed gratitude to Tilley for his presentation and his efforts

Corless applauded West Sacramento's leadership. He asked Tilley to identify what he thinks would be the biggest challenges to incorporate the Commission's recommendations into how the City functions as a city. Tilley noted that electrification would be a challenge and expressed appreciation for the addition to the Foundational Principles.

Matt Hertel with City of Sacramento presented an overview of City's process for updating the General Plan and Climate Action Plan, including community engagement and the importance of equity. Hertel shared about efforts to conduct a climate change vulnerability assessment and adaptation and resilience policy development and presented the City's draft Climate Action Plan strategies. Hertel also reviewed progress to-date, including a 28% reduction in municipal GHG emissions from 2005 to 2016, and near-term efforts to implement the Commission's recommendations. He noted that current CAP reduction

measures would not lead to carbon zero by 2045 and expressed commitment to exploring ways to achieve this vision. He provided an overview of opportunities for the Commission to remain involved.

Hansen shared about the City's efforts to prioritize infill development.

Litman expressed concerns regarding the City's gap analysis for achieving carbon neutrality by 2045. She urged the City to go back and look at how the City can reduce GHG emissions as much as possible by 2030, to align with the City's climate emergency declaration. Hertel responded and noted that what he presented was an initial gap analysis and that the City would continue exploring other measures. He also noted that the gap analysis assumes an all-electric new construction ordinance by 2021. Litman responded to encourage the City to do as much as possible and to consider the Commission's recommendations as a baseline rather than a cap.

Ayala expressed agreement with Litman's statement and also recognized that the City's ability to achieve carbon zero will also be influenced by State legislation and other policies. He urged others to participate in advocacy efforts. He asked Hertel about the City's process for remaining on course. Hertel noted the importance of implementation, monitoring, evaluation, and the City's commitment to update their CAP every five years to account for new policies and technological advancements.

Bray asked Hertel about the timeline of forming the Environmental Justice Collaborative Governance Committee, whether community engagement activities will be conducted virtually, and how the City will avoid unintended harm to communities. Hertel shared about the City's Environmental Justice Working Group and how the group has influenced the development of strategies; and efforts to more inclusively engage community members. Bray encouraged the City to be intentional and focused to understand the community's needs, priorities, and perspectives on the CAP strategies.

Julia Burrows noted that the City is aiming to identify individuals to invite to the Environmental Justice Collaborative Governance Committee by August 1st. The City identified five grants to pursue in order to bring resources to facilitators, for community engagement, and to address broadband access. Burrows emphasized that the Committee will be community-led.

Pope-Harden expressed concerns around how the Commission is looking at equity and justice, noting that equity and justice came in later rather than serving as a starting point. She expressed the importance of authentic, inclusive, and accessible community engagement. She also highlighted the urgency of environmental justice issues and the disproportionate impacts that some communities are already facing. She encouraged the City to be adaptable and responsive to community needs.

Near-term Actions and Opportunities

Stausboll expressed appreciation for commissioners who made commitments to support the cities in achieving carbon zero by 2045.

Nelson shared Sacramento State's commitment to the Commission's recommendations, including building electrification, community health and resiliency, and increasing trips by active transition to 30% and trips by public transit by 2030.

Li shared SacRT's commitment to extending free student fares for another year, developing a strategy for converting fleets to zero emissions, operating the new airport express bus service with electric buses as soon as those vehicles can be procured, prioritize the joint development of surplus property to facilitate

transit-oriented development, and finalizing a high-capacity bus/bus rapid transit study to implement a regional BRT network.

Wick shared Resources for Independent Living's commitment to providing staff resources and guidance to the cities. Wick also thanked the public, TAC members, commissioners, Local Government Commission

Orchard shared appreciation for efforts focused on bringing equity into the Commission's work. He shared SMUD's commitment to investing in decarbonization and electrification, scaling efforts to support and invest in low-income communities, expanding the Shade Tree program, investing \$15 million in the California Mobility Center, and exploring partnerships and innovative ways to achieve carbon zero.

Litman shared 350 Sacramento's commitment to participating in the City's CAP update process, advocating for an accelerated timeline for the Commission's recommendations, organizing events to educate and engage community members in environmental justice, and holding decision-makers responsible for making a rapid and just transition to carbon zero (focusing on the 2030 target).

Arnold highlighted the importance of partnerships across all sectors. Arnold shared Valley Vision's commitments to supporting and advocating for the Commission's recommendations across all sectors and the Year One Projects, coordinating efforts to influence state policy regarding air quality, facilitating community air monitoring in high pollution burden neighborhoods and providing communities with the resources and tools they need, and actively participating in regional and statewide climate adaptation work. She invited all commissioners to join the Capital Region Climate Readiness Collaborative.

Rodriguez highlighted that Kaiser achieved carbon neutral as an organization in 2020 by purchasing utility-scale electricity from renewable sources, installing solar arrays, improving energy efficiency, and purchasing carbon offsets.

Mohanna shared commitments to continue pushing the boundaries of development to enable residents to live car-free and adopt an active transportation lifestyle. She committed to integrating equity and innovation in construction, design, and technology in Mohanna Development's next project.

Corless thanked members of the public for sharing comments. He highlighted the importance of serving as a model and getting the attention of decision-makers. He expressed the importance of equity and requested guidance for how SACOG can invest in communities in need to shape community-based mobility programs and solutions – so that communities are ready to receive future funding from SACOG.

Wieser thanked members of the public for sharing comments, Local Government Commission staff, the mayors, commissioners, and for allowing her to provide a regional perspective from Elk Grove. She shared commitments to ensuring youth feel connected to nature and committed to climate action and preservation of the natural world.

Closing Remarks

Chair Stausboll expressed gratitude to commissioners for their passion, commitment, and inspiration. She also thanked the mayors for launching this initiative, funders for making this work possible, TAC leads and members for their countless hours of critical work, youth summit organizers, City staff, Metro Chamber for hosting the business roundtables and their candor, and all of the public members who provided comment and attended meetings for constantly pushing the Commission. She thanked Kate for her leadership and Julia for her commitment, as well as Jennifer Gress who helped to launch this effort.

Stausboll shared that the Commission's final report and technical report will be shared with the mayors tomorrow. She thanked all of the commissioners for their ongoing commitment and collaboration during the meeting. She encouraged all public members to continue advocating.

Adjournment

Chair Stausboll adjourned the meeting at 6:50pm.